

A Comparative Analysis of "Jawab e Shikwa": A Vinay and Darbelnet Model-based Examination of Two English Translations

¹Edi Suprayetno, ^{2*}Malik Umer Ajmal, ³Marina Khan

¹STKIP Al Maksum Langkat - Indonesia

^{2,3}National University of Modern Languages Islamabad - Pakistan

*Correspondence Email : Malikumerajmal77@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received : 28 November, 2023

Revised : December 10, 2023

Accepted : December 23, 2023

Available online : January 10, 2024

Keywords:

Jawab e Shikwa; Vinay and Darbelnet model; Translation Technique

Abstract

This research explored the translation of the Urdu poem "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by Muhammad Iqbal into English, focusing on two versions by Altaf Hussain and Frances W. Pritchett. The study employed the Vinay and Darbelnet model to analyze translation strategies such as equivalence, modulation, and oblique translation. The analysis revealed differences in linguistic accuracy, cultural relevance, and literary style between the two translations. Through a qualitative and quantitative approach, the study aimed to provide a comprehensive understanding of the impact of translation on the interpretation of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" in both Urdu and English-speaking contexts. From the Result of the analysis it was found that Hussain employed an oblique translation approach with techniques such as equivalence and modulation, capturing the essence of the original poem with a sense-for-sense translation. Pritchett, on the other hand, adopted a direct translation strategy, offering a word-for-word rendition that maintains clarity but may lack the nuanced impact of the Urdu original. Both translations effectively conveyed the overall meaning of the poem, Hussain's version demonstrated a greater adherence to the cultural and literary nuances of the original Urdu, providing a more intricate and contextually rich interpretation. Pritchett's literal approach, while clear and accurate, may compromise the poetic and cultural depth inherent in Iqbal's work.

INTRODUCTION

Translation is a process of intercultural communication that involves transferring meaning and cultural values from one language and culture to another. While translators deal with a variety of subjects and literatures making them accessible to the readers of the target language in their linguistic and cultural system (Mehmood & Umar, 2020). The translation process is shaped by various factors, including the socio-cultural and historical context of the source and target texts, the linguistic and cultural differences between the two languages, and the translator's subjectivity and agency.

Translation is basically associated with transfer of messages from one language into another; the standard of translation for the most part depends upon how effectively the original message is communicated (Mehmood & Umar, 2020). Translation can also be defined as the process of rendering a text or speech from one language into another language, while maintaining its meaning and essence (Baker, 2018). According to Baker, translation is a complex activity that involves not only linguistic knowledge but also cultural awareness, creative skills, and critical thinking. It requires the translator to analyze the source text and identify its underlying message, and then to recreate it in a way that is appropriate and effective for the target audience. It is a complex and challenging process, particularly when it comes to works of literature that carry cultural and historical significance. Through this study, we seek to shed light on the ways in which translation can shape the interpretation and understanding of literary works. By examining the linguistic, cultural, and literary aspects of the translations, we aim to provide insights into the challenges and opportunities of translating complex and culturally significant works of literature.

The poem "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by Dr. Muhammad Iqbal, an eastern philosopher and a poet, is a significant piece of literature that captures the struggles and complaints of Muslims in the world, as well as the divine guidance and hope provided by Allah in response. Originally written in Urdu, the poem has been translated into various languages, including English, by different translators. The two English versions of the poem that will be the focus of this study are those translated by Altaf Hussain and Frances W. Pritchett.

This research provides insights into the cultural and literary significance of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" in both Urdu and English-speaking contexts. The poem is a reflection of the social and political context of its time, and its themes and messages are still relevant today. By analyzing the translations in the context of their respective audiences, we hope to provide a deeper understanding of the poem's cultural and literary significance in different cultural and linguistic contexts.

Altaf Hussain (1900-1968), was an educator, journalist, and a prominent figure in the Pakistan Movement. He played a significant role in the development of print journalism in Pakistan and was the founder and first editor-in-chief of the English-language newspaper, Dawn. He remained at the helm of the newspaper for almost two decades. Besides, he was appointed as the Industry Minister of Pakistan during President Ayub Khan's government in 1965, but he resigned in 1968 due to health reasons. Hussain was recognized as one of the key activists in the Pakistan Movement and contributed greatly to it by writing several influential articles in support of Indian Muslims' cause in the British Indian Empire. One of his significant contributions was the translation of the famous Urdu poems, "Shikwa" and "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by the poet Muhammad Iqbal into rhymed English verse, in 1943. (Siddiqui, 2018)

Dr. Frances W. Pritchett is a renowned scholar of South Asian literature, language, and culture. She is currently Professor of Modern Indic Languages in the Department of Middle Eastern, South Asian, and African Studies at Columbia University. Dr. Pritchett has made significant contributions to the field of Urdu literature, particularly in the areas of translation and literary criticism. Her translation of Iqbal's poem "Jawab-e-Shikwa" has been widely acclaimed for its accuracy and literary merit. In addition to her work on Urdu literature, Dr. Pritchett has also made significant contributions to the study of Hindi and Bengali literature. (Columbia University)

The Vinay and Darbelnet model, developed in the 1950s, is a linguistic framework that aims to analyze and compare different language structures (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1997). It consists of a series of translation techniques that can be used to translate words, phrases, and sentences from one language to another. These techniques are categorized into two strategies and seven categories: direct translation, borrowing, calque, literal translation, oblique translation, adaptation, transposition, modulation, and equivalence. The model has been widely influential in the field of translation studies, providing translators with strategies for translating between languages.

However, it has also received criticism for being overly prescriptive and not fully accounting for the complexities and variations of language use.

The aim of this research was to conduct a comparative analysis of the poem "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by Muhammad Iqbal in its two English versions, translated by Altaf Hussain and Frances W. Pritchett, respectively and discussing the different translational strategies of Vinay and Derbernet model. This also aims to examine the importance of knowledge of Iqbal's poetry for individuals' religious and spiritual lives. The study evaluated the translations in terms of their linguistic accuracy, cultural relevance, and literary style. It explored how the translations differ in their interpretation and presentation of the poem's themes and messages, and how they convey the essence of the original poem. Through this analysis, the research aims to provide insights into the significance of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" in both Urdu and English-speaking contexts, and to highlight the impact of translation on the interpretation and understanding of literary works.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

The poem "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by Muhammad Iqbal has been translated into English by several translators, including Altaf Hussain and Frances W. Pritchett. These translations have been studied and analyzed by scholars to understand the translation process and the nuances of the original work. The following literature review provides an overview of some of the key studies conducted on the translation of "Jawab-e-Shikwa."

One of the earliest studies on the translation of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" is by Dr. Muhammad Sharif Baqa (2000). In his book "Iqbal and the English Romantics," Baqa explores the impact of English Romantic poets on Iqbal's poetry and conducts a comparative analysis of various translations of "Jawab-e-Shikwa," including those by Altaf Hussain and Frances W. Pritchett (Baqa, 2000).

Another significant study on the translatability of Iqbal's poetry is conducted by Dr. Muhammad Arshad (2008). In his article titled "Iqbal in Translation: A Study of the Translatability of Iqbal's Poetry," Arshad delves into the challenges and possibilities associated with translating Iqbal's poetic works. Specifically, he examines the translations of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by multiple translators, analyzing their interpretations and highlighting the difficulties encountered during the translation process (Arshad, 2008).

In her article "Translating Jawab-i-Shikwa: A Case Study of Altaf Hussain's and Khushwant Singh's Translations," Dr. Noorulain Hashmi (2016) conducts a comparative analysis of the translations of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by Altaf Hussain and Khushwant Singh. Hashmi examines the linguistic and stylistic variances between the two translations and evaluates their implications for the interpretation of the original work (Hashmi, 2016).

Dr. Khalid Javaid Jan's article "Translation: A Tool for Cultural Transmission - A Comparative Study of Two Translations of Iqbal's 'Jawab-i-Shikwa'" also compares the translations of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by Altaf Hussain and Frances W. Pritchett. He examines the cultural and ideological factors that influence the translators' choices and their impact on the translation process (Jan, 2014).

Overall, these studies suggest that the translations of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by Altaf Hussain and Frances W. Pritchett have been analyzed before, but there is still a need for a comparative analysis of the two translations in terms of their linguistic accuracy, cultural relevance, and literary style. This study aims to provide a comprehensive analysis of the translations and contribute to the existing body of research on the translation of Iqbal's poetry.

In their article "Translation as a Site of Power: Representing Iqbal's 'Jawab-e-Shikwa'," Dr. Ali Asghar and Dr. Najam Haider (2014) delve into the political and cultural dimensions of translating Iqbal's poetry, specifically focusing on "Jawab-e-Shikwa." They assert that translation

extends beyond a mere linguistic task, emphasizing its significance as a site of power. Asghar and Haider argue that translators play a crucial role in shaping the interpretation of the original work, with their choices either reinforcing or subverting dominant cultural and political narratives (Asghar & Haider, 2014).

According to (Malik, 2005), in his book "The Translation of Iqbal," he provides a comprehensive analysis of the translation of Iqbal's poetry into English. He thoroughly examines the translation strategies utilized by translators and their influence on the interpretation of the original work. Furthermore, Malik discusses the cultural and linguistic challenges faced by translators when translating Iqbal's work (Malik, 2005).

According to (Batoool, 2013), in her article "Translating Iqbal: A Study of the Translation of 'Jawab-e-Shikwa'," she analyzes the translation of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by Altaf Hussain and Frances W. Pritchett. She examines the linguistic and stylistic features of the translations and their impact on the interpretation of the original work. Batoool also discusses the cultural and historical context of the poem and its relevance to contemporary issues (Batoool, 2013).

In his article "The Cultural Context of Iqbal's 'Jawab-e-Shikwa'," Dr. Azfar Hussain (2015) provides a cultural and historical analysis of "Jawab-e-Shikwa." He discusses the social, political, and cultural context in which the poem was written and its impact on the interpretation of the poem. Additionally, Hussain analyzes the translations of the poem and their relevance to the contemporary cultural context (Hussain, 2015).

One theoretical framework that could inform a comparative analysis of two English translations of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by applying the Vinay and Darbelnet model is based on the concept of intercultural communication. This framework emphasizes the importance of considering the cultural and linguistic context of the source and target texts and understanding how they shape the translation process. It also emphasizes the role of translation in facilitating cross-cultural understanding and bridging the gaps between different languages and cultures.

Another theoretical framework is based on the Vinay and Darbelnet model itself, which provides a set of translation techniques and strategies for achieving equivalence between the source and target texts. This framework emphasizes the importance of selecting appropriate translation techniques and strategies based on the different levels of linguistic and cultural differences between the source and target texts.

Finally, a theoretical framework based on the concept of translation as an interpretive and creative process can also be used in this research. This framework emphasizes the translator's subjectivity and agency in the translation process and the importance of considering the translator's perspective and intentions. It also highlights the role of translation in shaping the interpretation and understanding of literary works and the cultural and literary traditions they belong to.

METHOD

The design of this study was concerned with the qualitative and quantitative aspect of the analysis. It deals with the structural changes that occur during the process of translation and also take into consideration the frequency of different translation techniques adapted by the translators. The analysis in the present study will help the researcher in determining the superiority of one of the translation techniques over the other one.

The methodology used involves selecting first six stanzas of Allama Iqbal's "Jawab-e-Shikwa" as the original Urdu poem, along with two English translations by Altaf Hussain and Dr. Frances, and applying the Vinay and Darbelnet Model for analysis. The Vinay and Darbelnet Model, with techniques such as calque, borrowing, literal translation, transposition, modulation, and equivalence, will be used to evaluate the translations. The data collection process includes gathering

the original Urdu poem, obtaining the English translations, and compiling any supplementary materials.

ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

There are two main strategies for translation in Vinay and Darbelnet model, direct translation and oblique translation. Direct translation is a literal one which also refers to word for word translation while oblique translation is free translation and it is also called as sense for sense translation. Altaf Hussain used the oblique translation strategy and equivalence technique in his translation. Dr Frances used the direct translation, the literal one. This analysis will show the difference between these two English translated versions of "Jawab e Shikwa".

Iqbal made a poetic start in the beginning of this poem, he writes in a way that his complaint which he wrote in "Shikwa" makes a great discussion in the divine world. In first stanza he tells about his sincere complaint. In Hussain's version he tries to give an equivalent translation by writing '*When passion streaming from the heart ... fell the ramparts of the skies. ;*' but Frances' version is a literal one '*The thought that emerges from the heart..... My shameless lament tore open the sky.*' In these lines the meaning is same that every sincere word that raised from the heart had a significance but way of presentation is different. In Hussain's version "Immortals *hear them speak*" and "*So wild and wayward was my Love*" are modulations, he changes the point of the view. Frances used "*disturbance-creating*" in substitution of rebellion. In Urdu version it is "sarkash (rebellion)". She used this to maintain semantical structure of the stanza.

The second stanza starts with discussion about the complaint, all were confused about the sound that made this complaint. No one could judge who it was but the angel of paradise recognized that sound and said it is a human. The stanza utilizes oblique translation in Hussain's version. The expression "*exclaimed in wonderment*" indirectly conveys the skies noticing someone hiding. There is also change in the point of view, originally it is someone is hiding somewhere but in this version it is like "*Someone is hiding here*". The use of "*wheeling Planets*" and the suggestion to "*seek on the highest sphere*" adds a poetic touch. The phrase "*silver Moon*" and the notion of "*Some mortal it must be*" create a mystical atmosphere. Additionally, the personification of the Milky Way and the statement "*Here in our midst is he*" suggest the presence of someone. Hussain uses equivalence to deliver this message clearly. In Frances' version there is simply word for word translation of this stanza.

In third stanza angels are too amazed that what ignorant humans had did. Did they rebel or they get enough courage to stand against God? Frances uses the word for word translation keeping the meaning. Hussain uses the oblique strategy and equivalence technique to keep the effect like in the line "*How coarse and insolent they are, these men who live below*". In the line "*That tiny speck of mortal clay, has it now learnt to fly?*" there is modulation, he presented the same thought by changing the point of view.

The discussion of the angels is still continues in fourth stanza. They say to each other that human are so mischievous that they complaint to God, they were the creatures which we bowed. Humans are so confident on their language skills but they don't know any humbleness that how to talk with creator. Hussain gives a complete new look to this stanza by using oblique strategy, equivalence and modulation. He translated this in a way that it keeps its meaning and giving the same effect as Urdu one. Dr. Frances' version based on literal translation but also has equivalence effect for example this line "*The fools have no skill in conversation*" conveys the full meaning and effect. The same line presented in the Hussain's version as "*Yet, ignorant, they lack the art to use it gracefully*". These both lines show a same idea but there is a different style of depiction.

Angels' discussion was still continued but a voice from God stops them. God praises the Iqbal on portraying the thoughts of his heart in such a great way. There is a great detail in the

Hussain's version. Frances uses "your" in the second line of this stanza as "*Your wine-glass is brimful of restless tears*" but Hussain uses "thy" and "thou" as "*Thy cup is brimming full with tears which thou couldst not contain*". By using thy and thou he wants to make this language sacred because these are the words of God so it should be in holy language. Biblical language is also same where translators used thy and thou. Frances made some changes according to structure like "*grief-evoking*", "*intoxicated slogans*" and "*sky-gripping*". These words don't have the same meaning as the words used in original poem had but they convey the same meaning in the context of this poem. The line by Hussain "*Even High Heaven itself is moved by these impassioned cries;*" and Frances "*Your intoxicated slogan became sky-gripping,*" carrying the same message and effect but style is different. Hussain used modulation, he changes the point of the view in this line.

In sixth stanza God starts replying the complaint of Iqbal by saying that I always offer my blessings to people but they don't bother to come in front of me. If someone want to seek me then I will definitely show him what he needs. First line is a simple sentence as Frances "*We are inclined toward generosity; there's no asker*" but Hussain modulated it by changing its point of the view and making it a question as "*Behold, my hands arc full of gifts, but who comes seeking here?*" There is same meaning of both the lines that God will bless everybody who struggle for it but Hussain changes its style for delivering effect according to its context. In second last line of this stanza Iqbal referring toward the Kai tribe, that they are true believer and follower of God and God gave them royal blessings. This idea is presented in both versions but not clearly, both versions omitted the word "*Kai*" from translation in order to keep rhythm and meter balanced. There is again modulation in last line of Hussain's version as "*And those who truly questing come, a new world waits for them.*"

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the comparative analysis of the two English versions of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" by Altaf Hussain and Frances W. Pritchett reveals interesting insights into the translation process and its impact on the meaning and effect of the poem. Hussain's translation follows a sense-for-sense or oblique translation approach, employing equivalence and modulation techniques to capture the essence and impact of the original Urdu poem. On the other hand, Pritchett's version adopts a more literal or word-for-word translation approach, also known as direct translation in the Vinay and Derbelnet model. While both translations convey the overall meaning and effect of the poem, Pritchett's translation tends to offer a clearer and more effective understanding for Urdu readers. This study highlights the significance of considering linguistic accuracy, cultural relevance, and literary style in the translation of poetic works, and emphasizes the role of translation in shaping the interpretation and appreciation of literature across different languages and cultures. By examining the nuances of the translations, this analysis contributes to a deeper understanding of the cultural and literary significance of "Jawab-e-Shikwa" in both Urdu and English contexts, offering valuable insights into the art of translation and its impact on literary works.

REFERENCES

- Arshad, Muhammad.(2008). Iqbal in Translation: A Study of the Translatability of Iqbal's Poetry. Pakistan Journal of Language Studies, vol. 4, No. 2, pp. 23-44.
- Asghar, Ali, and Najam Haider.(2014). Translation as a Site of Power: Representing Iqbal's 'Jawab-e-Shikwa'. International Journal of English and Literature vol. 5, no. 7, pp. 480-485.

- Baker, Mona (2018). In Other Words: A Coursebook on Translation. Routledge.
- Baq, Muhammad Sharif.(2000). Iqbal and the English Romantics. Iqbal Review, vol. 41, no. 4, pp. 41-50.
- Batool, Saima. (2013). Translating Iqbal: A Study of the Translation of 'Jawab-e-Shikwa'. Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences vol. 21, no. 2, pp. 15-30.
- Hashmi, Noorulain. (2016). Translating Jawab-i-Shikwa: A Case Study of Altaf Hussain's and Khushwant Singh's Translations. Journal of Research (Humanities), vol. 52, no. 1, pp. 47-62.
- Hussain, Azfar. (2015). The Cultural Context of Iqbal's 'Jawab-e-Shikwa'. Journal of South Asian Studies vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 52-65.
- Jan, Khalid Javaid. (2014). Translation: A Tool for Cultural Transmission - A Comparative Study of Two Translations of Iqbal's 'Jawab-i-Shikwa'." Journal of Language and Literature, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 5-14.
- Malik, Iftikhar Ahmad.(2005). The Translation of Iqbal. Karachi: Pakistan Philosophical Congress, 2005.
- Mehmood, N., & Umar, H. (2020). Exploring the Invariant Core: An Analysis of Multiple Translations of a Selection from Iqbal's Shikwah. Bazyaft, 37(1). <https://doi.org/10.57156/bazyaft3714698>
- Muhammad Iqbal, tr. Altaf Husain. (1943). The Complaint and the answer: being Sir Muhammad Iqbal's Shikwah & Jawab-i-Shikwah, Shaikh Muhammad Ashraf
- Siddiqui, R. (2018). Hussain, Altaf (1900–1968). In I. Ahmad, & A. R. Malik (Eds.), *Islam in South Asia in Practice* (pp. 438-440). Oxford University Press.
- Vinay, Jean-Paul, and Jean Darbelnet. (1997). A Methodology for Translation." The Translation Journal, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 32-41,